



MEETING MINUTES

Restoration Advisory Board (RAB) Public Interest Meeting

For the Former Naval Station Roosevelt Roads

Ceiba, Puerto Rico

Meeting No. 1 - November 28, 2006

Note: These minutes are a summary based on informal notes taken at the meeting. They are not intended as a verbatim transcript and may not have captured everything that was discussed.

I. CALL TO ORDER AND WELCOMING REMARKS

The meeting began at 6:18 PM with Susana Struve (CH2M HILL) welcoming everyone and introducing the presenters to the audience David Criswell, Base Realignment and Closure (BRAC) Environmental Coordinator, Navy; Mark Davidson, Remedial Project Manager for BRAC, Navy; Pedro Ruiz, Environmental Program Manager - Naval Activity Puerto Rico; Yarissa Martinez, Puerto Rico Environmental Quality Board (EQB); and Mark Kimes, Baker Environmental, Inc. (Navy Installation Restoration Program Contractor) were in attendance to address local community members' questions and concerns. See Attachment 1 for the attendance list.

II. TOPICS DISCUSSED AND PRESENTATIONS

IIa. Meeting Information Dissemination - Susana Struve asked through what method(s) (i.e., media, word of mouth, flyers, and personal contact) those present had been notified that the meeting would be held. Several had read the meeting announcement in *El Horizonte* (local newspaper, announcement published on November 15), one had received notification through the flyer placed at the post office, and others through phone communication or word of mouth.

Discussion Points

- Community member - Voiced concern that the meeting advertisements should be published earlier to give community more notice.

1

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

- Community member - Complained that the public wasn't adequately notified about the meeting, and that we need to cover more areas and notify more people through better methods.
- Susana asked what the best methods would be (newspaper?) and was told *El Horizonte*. Susana says for the next meeting we will work to provide better coverage and notification of meetings.

Ib. Navy/CH2M HILL Presentation - Susana Struve (CH2M HILL) gave a presentation that explained the RAB development process for the former Naval Base Roosevelt Roads, which is part of the Environmental Restoration Program. See Attachment 2 (presentations) for more details.

Discussion Points

- Rogelio Figueroa (Local Redevelopment Authority) - asked for further explanation about the Comprehensive Environmental Response Compensation and Liability Act (CERCLA) process. He would like to know more specifics about when the governor has to agree that the lands are environmentally suitable for the planned use.
- David Criswell (Navy) explained that CERCLA allows the early transfer of property to private or other owners before the cleanup takes place, as long as there is the guarantee that the land will undergo the cleanup under the auspice of the new owner. Roosevelt Roads is not on the National Priorities List and the cleanup is regulated under the Resource Conservation & Recovery Act (RCRA), so the governor can approve the Covenant Deferral Request. A document will be written by the Navy, in coordination with the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and EQB, detailing who will clean up the contamination of the property (the Navy, or the Governor of Puerto Rico, or the new owner) and what protections/controls will be put in place. The Governor will evaluate the Covenant Deferral Request and decide whether the land is environmentally suitable for early transfer.

Iic. Base History/Discussion

- Rogelio Figueroa (Local Redevelopment Authority) - asked for specific information regarding the decision to close the base and sell the land.
- David Criswell (Navy) didn't know exactly when it was decided but says he will find out the specific information - who decided, when, under what process.
- John Henry (community member) - asked about successful base closures in the U.S., and how they were achieved. He was concerned that if not correctly done by new property owners, how will they be fined or punished?
- Yarissa Martinez (EQB) explained that she has spoken with people involved in the cleanup, and that the people here can rest easy because they will bring in experts who will assist them technically.
- Maria Avila (community member) said that the Navy should clean up because they were responsible. Also, she doesn't have faith in the system here in Puerto Rico to

2

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

carry through with the cleanup process. She demanded that the Navy clean it up – they were the ones who contaminated it.

- Community member – complained that the proposed schedule is not realistic, and when will the public document be made available for public review/comments?
- David Criswell agreed that the schedule is a little ambitious, and will be revised. The public comment period will begin in the next 60 to 90 days, moved to January/February of next year.
- Lirio Marquez (community member) asked whether the Covenant Deferral Request will include information about all possible contaminated sites at Roosevelt Roads.
- Yarissa Martinez explained the investigation and monitoring process. David Criswell added that public input is helpful in identifying possible sites of contamination.
- Angel de Jesus (community member) is worried about the time that will be required to clean up the sites. Will it be a long time? Also expressed concern about contamination affecting health of local population.
- David Criswell replied that the contamination is currently controlled. If there was an immediate health concern, it would have been cleaned up immediately, per Federal regulations. Just because there will be new owners doesn't mean the cleanup process will stop. He said that post-transfer the cleanup will move just as fast as it is now.
- David Criswell also addressed the community member's concern about how the Puerto Rican government will manage the funds granted to them for cleanup. He said that the government will enter into a contract with the Navy, and will be responsible for the cleanup activities. However, the Navy is the legally responsible party, and must ensure the cleanup standards/goals are met.
- Carlos Brown is a former employee of the base tank farm. He expressed concern that the Puerto Rican contractors that are hired to perform the cleanup will not do a good job. He feels that the Navy will need to bring in contractors from the states to get the job done right.
- Several citizens say that they have first-hand knowledge of sites of contamination on the base.
- David Criswell emphasized the importance of their becoming part of the RAB, in order to provide this input to the Navy. He also adds that the Navy will thoroughly evaluate the capability of the companies that are contracted to perform the cleanup.

III. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:22 PM. Forms were distributed for people to fill out if they are interested in joining the RAB. Eight people filled out RAB interest forms.

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

IV. Action Items:

Description	Status (<i>will be updated in the next meeting minutes</i>)	Comments
Investigate more ways to disseminate public meeting notification: Yunque 93 (WYQE) (local radio station) – local broadcast every Thursday		
Broadcast meeting notice through megaphone car		
Advertise meeting notice in several newspapers with wide coverage: <i>El Horizonte, El Vocero</i>		
Develop more comprehensive mailing list		
Provide community with specific information (who, what, where, when) regarding the decision process to close the base and transfer land to new owners		
Revise anticipated schedule for document/ review, public comment period		

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

ATTACHMENT 1 - Meeting Attendees

Taller Público - Junta Consejera para la Restauración (RAB) - ROOSEVELT ROADS Centro de Uso Múltiple, Ceiba, Puerto Rico 28 de noviembre del 2006

Nombre/Name	Institución/Organization
Benitez, Ricardo	
Brown, Carlos	
Donato, Rafael	APRODEC (community group)
Ferrán, Paola Pascual	Portal Del Futuro (the redevelopment entity)
Figueroa, Ramón D.	
Figueroa, Rogelio	Local Redevelopment Authority, Community Representative
Laó(?), Carolos	Atabex (interpreter)
de Jesús, Ángel	
Henry, John T.	
McWhirter, Debra	
Velázquez, Luís A.	
Montes, Rafael	Representante Empleados Mantenimiento en la Base Naval (representative of the base maintenance employees)
Porto, Jorge Fernández	
Márquez, Lirio	
Velásquez, Agustín	Pescador (fisherman)
Ríos, Ramón	
Martinez, Alfonso	Local Redevelopment Authority
Rosa, José A.	
Ávila, Maria M.	APRODEC
Daniel F.	Pescador (fisherman)
Negrón, Luis	US EPA

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

ATTACHMENT 2 - Meeting Presentations

Note: This summary is presented in English and Spanish for the convenience of the reader. Every effort has been made for the translations to be as accurate as reasonably possible. However, readers should be aware that the English version of the text is the official version.

Nota: Este resumen se presenta en inglés y en español para la conveniencia del lector. Se han hecho todos los esfuerzos para que la traducción sea precisa en lo más razonablemente posible. Sin embargo, los lectores deben estar al tanto que el texto en inglés es la versión oficial.

Restoration Advisory Board (RAB)

for the

*former Naval Station Roosevelt
Roads*

Presented to

**Community Members
Ceiba, Puerto Rico**

November 28, 2006





The Cleanup Process

During the mid-1970s, the U.S. Department of Defense started a program to investigate hazardous waste. This is called the

Environmental Restoration Program





CERCLA and RCRA

- **The Environmental Restoration Program can include actions under two laws:**
- **Comprehensive Environmental Response Compensation and Liability Act (CERCLA)**
 - to investigate and cleanup past waste sites
 - to ensure that property transferred to new owners is environmentally suitable for use
- **Resource Conservation & Recovery Act (RCRA)**
 - to manage the disposal of present and future wastes





Former Roosevelt Roads

- **1994**
 - RCRA permit to manage wastes
 - Investigation and cleanup of waste sites underway
- **Naval Station was closed in 2004**
 - Additional possible waste sites identified for investigation
- **2006: RCRA Consent Order to guide investigation and clean up**
- **CERCLA “early transfer authority” allows Navy to sell parcels to new owners who will conduct the cleanup**
 - Governor of Puerto Rico must concur that the property is environmentally suitable for intended use
 - Public comment period





Community Involvement is important

- **Why should the local community be involved?**
 - Potentially affected by cleanup decisions
 - Should have input into the decision process
 - Have different interests, priorities and perspectives
 - Can help identify issues and values that should be considered





Community involvement in cleanup decisions

- **RCRA**

- Public comments on a Proposed Consent Order between the Navy and EPA (September 2006)
- Public comments on Corrective Measures Studies: before site-specific cleanup decisions are made (several dates in future)

- **CERCLA**

- Public comments on early transfer decision before Governor's approval



Restoration Advisory Board Policy

- **Navy and EPA guidance promotes Restoration Advisory Boards (RABs) as a vehicle of community involvement**
 - RAB participation ensures consistent public awareness and involvement throughout the cleanup process, not just at the end
 - RABs are required by DoD policy where closed bases are being transferred





Purpose of a RAB

- **A forum for exchanging information between agencies and the community**
 - Opportunity for community to review progress and discuss with the agencies' decision makers
 - Opportunity for agencies to obtain constructive community review and comments on environmental cleanup activities





Purpose of a RAB (continued)

- **Advice from the RAB provides the agencies with a much-needed local perspective**
 - Government agencies are legally responsible for making environmental restoration decisions
 - *Navy, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and Puerto Rico Environmental Quality Board*
 - The agencies will give respectful consideration to the comments of RAB members





When is a RAB formed?

- When military installations are closed
 - At any Navy installation with an Environmental Restoration Program
 - Where there is sufficient community interest
 - If a request is made by the local or state government
- **Because Roosevelt Roads is closed and will be transferred to new owners, a RAB is needed**





Make-up of the RAB

- **Usually about 20-25 members total**
 - Includes local community members and representatives from Navy, State and EPA
- **Should reflect the different interests and concerns of the local community**
 - Long-time and new residents, businesses, fishing, farming, environmental, medical, people who belong to groups, and people who don't...
- **RAB meetings are always open to the public**



Potential Candidates for Membership

- **Local government officials and agencies**
- **Local residents**
 - Business owners/operators
 - School Principal or Teacher
 - Religious leader
 - Civic and social group leaders
 - Interested individuals
- **What is “local”?**
 - Ceiba, Naguabo and Fajardo





Forming a RAB

- **Announce the formation of a RAB**
 - Explain what a RAB does
 - Invite interested members of the public to join the RAB
 - *A public notice was placed in local newspapers*
 - *Flyers were mailed and handed out*
- **A public information meeting is held**
 - That's why we're here tonight





RAB Application Process

- **Interested people complete a community interest form**
 - Reason for interest in the RAB
 - What benefit does the person offer to the RAB
 - Personal information is kept private, but RAB members' names can be published





Selection of RAB Members

- **If < 20-25 local residents respond, all will be accepted**
- **If > 20-25 respond, a selection panel will nominate RAB members**
 - List of RAB members should represent the diverse interests and points of view throughout the community
 - Members serve voluntarily
 - Navy accepts or rejects the entire list





RAB Selection Panel

- **Made up of 3-4 community leaders**
 - Navy will organize the panel with advice from EPA and EQB
 - *Selection Panel members cannot be on the RAB*
 - Establishes selection criteria and nominates RAB members
 - Selection Panel's job ends when the RAB is formed





Officers of the RAB

- **The RAB is typically led by two Co-Chairs**
 - One is elected to represent the Community members and the second represents the Navy
- **EQB member and EPA member**
 - They will serve as a resource to RAB members, listen to their views, help to facilitate resolutions and ensure standards and regulations are met
- **LRA member at closing bases**
 - Comments on cleanup issues related to planned land use



Role of Community Co-Chair

- **Community Co-Chair is selected by community members. He/She:**
 - Coordinates with the Navy Co-Chair and other RAB members to plan the meetings
 - Ensures that community issues and concerns are expressed to the Navy
 - Helps to get information out to the general public
 - Reports meeting proceedings back to the community





Role of Navy Co-Chair

- **Navy Co-Chair is appointed. He/She:**
 - Coordinates with the Community Co-Chair to plan the meetings
 - Ensures that community concerns are met
 - Provides relevant policies and documents to the RAB
 - Ensures that administrative support is provided for RAB meetings (meeting notices, minutes)
 - Reports meeting proceedings to Navy



Role of RAB Community Members

- **Attend RAB meetings**
 - Participate openly and constructively
 - Regular attendance is critical for a successful RAB
- **Provide suggestions and community input**
 - Will be used by the agencies in making decisions on investigations and cleanup
- **Each member provides advice as an individual**
 - The RAB usually does not vote on issues or make recommendations as a group



Role of RAB Community Members (continued)

- **Promote community awareness**
 - Actively share information with other community members
- **Review and comment on draft final or final documents**
 - Read reports between the meetings and come prepared to discuss them
- **Identify projects for technical assistance (TAPP) funding**
 - A technical adviser may be hired, if necessary, for full community understanding and participation





RAB Training

- **RAB members are given training as needed in their duties and operating procedures**
 - Training will be given during RAB meetings
 - *Collaborative effort by EPA, the Navy, EQB, and the Local Reuse Authority*
 - A nationwide RAB Co-Chair training event is held every few years.
 - *One person from each RAB can attend*





RAB Operating Procedures

- **A charter signed by members sets up:**
 - Policies on attendance
 - Procedures for replacing, adding, or removing members
 - Length of service for Community Co-Chair
 - Methods of resolving disputes
 - Process for incorporating public input



Questions? Comments?



Mr. David Criswell , P.E.

**Navy BRAC Program
Management Office
Southeast**

4130 Faber Place Drive,
Suite 202

North Charleston, SC 29405

Teléfono: 843-743-2130

Fax: 843-743-2142

Correo electrónico/email:
david.criswell@navy.mil

Ms. Yarissa Martinez

Junta de Calidad Ambiental

Oficina del Presidente - Piso 5

Ave. Ponce de Leon #1308

Carr Estatal 8838, Sector El
Cinco

Rio Piedras, PR 00926

Teléfono: 787-365-8573

Fax: 787-767-4861

Correo electrónico/email:
Yarissa.Martinez@jca.gobiern
o.pr

